



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1:**

|                          |                                                                                                                      |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#"><u>American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</u></a>                                                  |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2013_AJEA_5222                                                                                                       |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effect of Skip-Row Cotton Planting Pattern and Plant Density on Cotton Growth, Yield, Fiber Quality, and Net Returns |
| Type of the Article      | Research paper                                                                                                       |

**General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:**

**[\(http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline\)](http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)**

- This form has total 7 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



## SDI Review Form 1.6

### **PART 2: Review Comments**

|                                            | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <p><b>General comments</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The subject treated in this manuscript is interesting for the journal. However, minor revision of the manuscript is necessary to bring the level to an acceptable standard for publication.</li> <li>2. Corrections to the title are to be considered by the authors to make the title of the paper sharp and concise.</li> <li>3. The introduction was thorough and very good.</li> <li>4. Some information is needed to complete the description given in the methodology.</li> <li>5. Significance of the findings presented in the results should be discussed by the authors instead of merely presenting what others have published.</li> <li>6. A “conclusion” stating the study’s major findings and recommendations is missing in both the abstract and at the end of the manuscript itself.</li> <li>7. The reference list is comprehensive; however, the referencing style should be corrected to conform to that required by the journal.</li> <li>8. Explanatory text and footnotes are missing for some of the tables presented in the manuscript.</li> <li>9. Minor sentence restructuring and typographical mistakes in the manuscript are to be corrected by the authors.</li> <li>10. For easy reviewing and line referencing during reviewing, the authors should consider continuous line numbering for the whole manuscript instead of restarting numbering on each page.</li> </ol> <p><b>Note:</b> The comments listed above are elaborated in the “Minor revision comments” listed below.</p> | <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Discussed in earlier review</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Formatted according to template</p>                                                |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                |
|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> | <p><b>Note</b> in the comments below," P" refers to Page Number, and "L" refers to Line Number.</p> <p><b>Title</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>P1, L2-3: Consider changing the title to "Effect of Skip-Row Cotton Planting Pattern and Density on Cotton Growth, Yield, Fiber Quality, and Net Returns".</li> </ol> <p><b>Abstract</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>P1, L3-4: Consider restructuring the aim as follows: "To evaluate the effect of two cotton planting patterns across two plant densities on cotton growth, yield, fiber quality, and net returns."</li> <li>P1, L7: Why were the results of this study not published earlier? The year 2003 is already 10 years ago. Are the factors surrounding the study (seeds, soil, environment, treatment methods, cultivation technology etc.) still applicable today?</li> <li>P1, L7-8: Sentence should be corrected to ...2003 and 2004 growing seasons...</li> <li>P1, L10: The word "slightly" is vague. Consider removing it from the sentence. Sentence should be: "Rows were spaced 91.4 cm apart on raised beds." Specify how raised the beds were in the methodology section in the actual text.</li> <li>P1, L14: The use of brackets is not recommended in abstracts. Consider rewriting the sentence to read ...populations of 84000 and 126000 plants/ha.</li> <li>Provide a "conclusion" stating the study's major findings and recommendations in the abstract.</li> </ol> <p><b>Introduction</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Nicely written introduction.</li> <li>P3, L2: Rephrase the sentence to for example:</li> </ol> | <p>Changed</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Yes, the factors are still applicable today.</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> |
|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>“Additionally, partial budget analysis was preformed to evaluate the returns of conventional planting patterns as compared to skip-row patterns. This changes the sentence to specify the aim rather than the methodology used.</p> | Done                                                           |
|  | <p><b>Methodology</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. P5, L23: Provide information about the experimental plot size. The authors provided this information only in the abstract.</li> </ol>                              | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. P6, L7: Provide information about how rainfall was measured, or how rainfall data was collected.</li> </ol>                                                                                  | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. P6, L8-13: “Rainfall during...”. Consider moving information about rainfall to the results section. Discuss how rainfall influenced the study.</li> </ol>                                    | Mentioned in Conclusions. Rainfall did not affect the results. |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. P6, L17: Provide information about the machine for harvesting. Some harvesting machines are known to have high rate of loss and will affect the data collected from the study.</li> </ol>    | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5. P6, L18: Also provide information about weighing wagon.</li> </ol>                                                                                                                           | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. P6, L22: Provide information about how the areas were calculated to calculate the yield/area (kg/ha). Did the authors include also the skipped row areas?</li> </ol>                         | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. P7, L4: Not advisable to start a sentence with a number. Consider rephrasing the sentence to: “Prices for the year 2012 were used...”.</li> </ol>                                            | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>8. P7, L12: Correct typographical error: “...kg <b>for</b> lint and ginning...”.</li> </ol>                                                                                                     | Done                                                           |
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>9. P7, L15: Clarify the data model statement for the factorial design.</li> </ol>                                                                                                               | Done                                                           |
|  | <p><b>Results and Discussion</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. P8, L12-13: Replace the letter “X” in the sentences to “times”.</li> </ol>                                                                              | Done                                                           |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                           |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. P9, L15: Seeding rate had no effect on any variable evaluated. Provide data and analysis results to back this statement.</li> <li>3. P9, L11, etc.: For all the topics discussed in sections and sub sections 3.1-3.5, the authors should discuss the significance of the findings they obtained instead of merely presenting what others have published.</li> <li>4. P10 L14 &amp; L21, P11 L6 &amp; 12: Consider using sub sectioning e.g. 3.3.1 Days to cut-out, 3.3.2 Plant height etc.</li> <li>5. P10, L14: Consider rephrasing the sentence to: “In 2003, conventional <b>sold</b> pattern planting resulted...”.</li> <li>6. P11, L12: Provide information about how the areas in the two planting patterns were calculated to ensure that the yield difference was actually 257 kg. Refer to reviewer comment number 6 in the methodology section above.</li> <li>7. P14, L5-9. This discussion is very good and similar discussions should be made under other sections and subsections in the results. Refer to reviewer comment 3 above.</li> </ol> <p><b>Conclusion</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. P14, L10: Similar to the abstract, provide a “conclusion” stating the study’s major findings and recommendations. As compared to the abstract, be brief, but thorough here.</li> </ol> <p><b>Referencing</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. P14-19: Authors should refer to the “Guidelines for Authors” for the AJEA. Journal name abbreviations should be used. Publication year is after the journal abbreviation.<br/>For example, style for journal papers should be Authors. Title. Journal Abbreviation. Year: Volume (Issue): Page-page.</li> </ol> | <p>Discussed in previous reviews.</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                         |
|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|
|                                         | <p>e.g. <i>For Published paper:</i><br/>1. Hilly M, Adams ML, Nelson SC. A study of digit fusion in the mouse embryo. Clin Exp Allergy. 2002;32(4):489-98.</p> <p><b>Tables</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Explanatory text and footnotes are missing for Tables 2, 3 and 4 of the tables presented in the manuscript. Because of this, it is not possible to understand the extra information given with footnote labeled “a” in the tables.</li> <li>2. Authors should indicate footnotes with <b>superscript lowercase letters</b> and placed the footnotes not in the tables as they have done in Tables 5 and 6, but place them below the table with <b>superscript lowercase letters</b>.</li> </ol> | <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. General language review is needed after the “minor revisions” above have been made; to avoid grammatical and typographical errors.</li> </ol>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | <p>Done</p>             |